

ליקוטי ופסקי הלכות

"חוקי חיים"

ותלמוד
"חוקי חיים"
לעשות רצונך
בלבב שלם



שע"י "חדר הוראה" שכונת מנחת יצחק פעיה"ק ירושלים תובב"א - בראשות הרב חיים אהרן בלייער שליט"א

Halochohs compiled by HaRav Chaim Bleier – Translated from the Hebrew edition by R' Zerachya Shicker

Halochohs of Purim Meshulash

Request:

In these troubled time where people are not in the Batei Midrash, Please send to as many people as possible, with that, having a hand in spreading Torah and relevant Halochohs

To Donate



To Subscribe:

paskenshtibel@gmail.com

Click To Download
previous Gilyonos
[Archives](#)

ליקוטי ופסקי הלכות "חוקי חיים"

ותלמדם
"חוקי חיים"
לעשות רצונך
בלבב שלם



שע"י "חדר הוראה" שבונת מנחת יצחק פיעה"ק ירושלם תובב"א - בראשות הרב חיים אהרן בלייער שליט"א

Halachos compiled by HaRav Chaim Bleier – Translated from the Hebrew edition by R' Zerachya Shicker

Please do not
read during
davening or
Krias HaTorah

Purim Meshulash

Parshas Teruma – Zachor 5781

214

Purim Meshulash in Walled Cities – Yerushalayim

This year [5781/2021], the 14th of Adar falls on Friday and the 15th falls on Shabbos. Hence, most of the world is celebrating Purim on Friday [we wrote about the halachos of Purim on a Friday when the 15th fell on a Friday (see Issue 126)] while in Yerushalayim, Purim this year falls on Shabbos. [The next time this will happen is in 5785/2025, and after that, in 5805/2045.] This phenomenon is called "Purim Meshulash" because the mitzvos are spread over three days. Since this is fairly rare, we will elaborate on these halachos, and the rest of the world will learn them for the sake of limud Torah – "אורה" [in the posuk "ליהודים" (מגילה ט"ז) refers to Torah "היתה אורה"]].

Megilla

Reason for the Gezeira

1. Theoretically, the Megilla should be able to be read on Shabbos, as there is no inherent issur involved. However, Chazal decreed that the Megilla may not be read on Shabbos; the Gemara gives two reasons for this:
2. **Carrying.** According to Rabba, Chazal were afraid a person would take his Megilla to an expert to learn how to lein it [as not everyone is familiar with the Megilla's trop (באה"ט תרפ"ח סק"ו)], potentially carrying it four amos in a reshus harabim (מגילה ד:). Since the posuk (רש"י ב. ד"ה הל) says "ולא יעבור" – "it shall not pass" – the Megilla is read on Friday, Adar 14, instead of postponing it to Sunday (אסתר ט, כ"ז).
3. **Matanos la'evyonim.** According to Rav Yosef, it is because poor people look forward to the Megilla leining because they receive matanos la'evyonim then. We cannot give matanos la'evyonim on Shabbos since money is muktza (ערוך השלחן סי' תרפ"ח ס"ו) and most people give money (מחצית השקל), or because bringing matanos la'evyonim to poor people's houses can involve the issur of carrying (חזו"א או"ח קנ"ה סק"א), so Chazal decreed that the Megilla not be read on Shabbos; it is moved up to Friday based on the posuk "ולא יעבור."

Nature of the Gezeira

4. **Decree of Chazal.** Some hold that when the Anshei Knesses Hagedola established Purim, really the Megilla would have been read on Shabbos when Purim fell on Shabbos, but later chachamim ruled that it be moved up because of Rabba's reason (תשב"ץ ח"ג סי' רח"צ, טו"א שם ד"ה ע"ש זמנם בדעת רבה).
5. **"Divrei kabbala."** Others hold that the Anshei Knesses Hagedola gave future chachamim the ability to move Megilla reading up if necessary according to their judgment. When Purim falls on Shabbos and it is moved up, that is not considered a gezeira, but part of the original intent of the nevi'im and Anshei Knesses Hagedola. In other words, part of the original tradition was that Megilla reading can be moved up if necessary (רש"י לטו"א, מקראי קודש סי' נ"א ע"פ ריש) (ירושלמי, שו"ת בצל החכמה ח"ה סי' קל"א).

Megilla Reading On Time vs. at a Different Time

6. **Regular time, different time.** The Megilla reading is considered "on time" ["קריאה בזמנה"] when it is on the day the Anshei Knesses Hagedola designated for that place, i.e., Adar 14 in unwalled cities and Adar 15 in walled cities. In certain cases, they allowed the Megilla reading to take place on the 11th, 12th, or 13th of Adar, e.g., for villagers who read the Megilla on the prior Monday or Thursday (מגילה ב:) or for a traveler who cannot take a Megilla along to read it on time (שו"ע תרפ"ח ס"ז). When the Megilla is read early, it is considered "not at its regular time" ["קריאה שלא בזמנה"].

7. **Minyan or alone?** The practical difference between a Megilla reading on time vs. at a different time is that when it is on time, the Megilla can also be read without a minyan, though it is always best to have a minyan (שו"ע סי' תר"צ סי"ח) to more widely publicize the miracle (מ"ב ס"ק ס"א).
8. However, when the Megilla is not read at its usual time, there is more reason to be machmir to require a minyan since some Rishonim hold that a minyan is indispensable for the mitzva (ר"ף, מ"ב שם) (רשב"א, ר"ן הובאו בשער הציון שם ס"ק ס"א).
9. **Is a bracha made without a minyan?** When the Megilla is not read at its regular time and a minyan is not present, the poskim say no bracha should be made since whether or not a bracha should be made in this situation is a topic of dispute (מ"ב שם).

Is Megilla Reading on Friday Considered On Time?

10. **Regular time.** Some poskim hold that on a Purim Meshulash, Friday is considered its regular time since the Megilla reading was completely transferred from the 15th to the 14th, which in any event is the day everyone else reads the Megilla. According to this opinion, the Megilla can be read even if there is no minyan (מאירי, ספר ההשלמה, אור שמח בדעת הרמב"ם פ"א מגילה ה"ז, חזו"א סי' קנ"ה סק"ב).
11. **Not its regular time.** Others hold that it is considered a Megilla reading that is not at its regular time (רשב"א ד"ה שלא, הריטב"א ד"ה ומגילה, הר"ן הובאו ב"י ובדרכ"מ תר"צ ס"ה). Their reason is that since it is moved from its designated day, Chazal did not distinguish this Megilla reading from other ones that are not at their usual time (שער הציון סק"ט). Alternatively, when the Megilla is read at its true designated time, even if it is without a minyan the miracle is still publicized through the other mitzvos of the day, whereas if it is read without a minyan on Friday, there is no pirsumei nisa from the reading or the other mitzvos of the day, as with the exception of matanos la'evyonim – which is anyway collected throughout the year (טו"א) – the other mitzvos are not done on Friday (see below).
12. **Make sure to have a minyan.** Since the poskim argue whether the Megilla reading on Friday in a walled city is considered on time, one should make sure to read it with a minyan. Even people who are not usually particular to read it with a minyan should take care to do so this year to publicize the miracle (מ"ב סי' תר"צ ס"ק ס"א). Even if some members of the minyan have already been yotzei their chiyuv, they can help complete a minyan of ten (הגריש"א הליכות) (והנהגות עמ"ל 16, תשובות והנהגות).
13. **Bracha without a minyan.** If a person is in a bedieved situation and is reading the Megilla without a minyan, some poskim say he should not make a bracha (מ"ב שם).
14. However, the minhag of Yerushalayim is to make a bracha even without a minyan (הגרי"ח זוננפלד שלמת חיים סי' רס"ח, הגרימ"ט עיר) (הקודש והמקדש ח"א פלא ס"ב).

Women

15. Lechatchila, women must also hear the Megilla with a minyan to publicize the miracle. Thus, this year they should make an effort to go to shul to hear the Megilla (הגרי"ח זוננפלד).
16. **Ten women.** Women can satisfy the preference to have a minyan by having ten women, as that also publicizes the miracle (הגריש"א). Thus, ten women can get together in a house and have a man read the Megilla for them. One of the women should make the bracha before the reading and be motzi the others (חזו"א קנ"ה סק"ב, שלמת חיים סי' רס"ג). The minhag is that women do not say the bracha after the Megilla reading (הגרש"א, הליכות שלמה פ"ג הע"ג) (אשר הניא).

Being Part of the Minyan

17. **Counting men and women.** Women should not join men to make a minyan of ten people (הרמ"א סי' תר"צ סי"ח מסתפק בזה); doing so is inappropriate (פמ"ג א"א סקכ"ד). If they are all part of one family and household and there are no issues of immodesty, they can join together since the requirement to have ten people is to publicize the miracle, not to create the status of a tzibbur (חזו"א א"ח סי' קנ"ה סק"ב).
18. **Courtyards, balconies.** The ten people do not need to be in one place. As long as ten people can hear the reading from where they are standing, there is pirsumei nisa (מקראי קודש סי' נ'). Thus, people from multiple courtyards or balconies can all be counted to get to ten people. This is what a person should do in light of the current situation if he cannot go to shul to hear the Megilla.
19. **Phone, Zoom.** Due to the current situation, certain innovators suggested that people who are unable to hear the Megilla in shul or from a baal korei should hear it over the phone or computer. They also suggested that if there are ten people listening, it is considered a Megilla reading with a minyan because the miracle is publicized that way. However, it should be known that the consensus of all the poskim is that we should not invent new methods and hear the Megilla over any sort of device. It is very likely that one is not yetzei this way altogether (אג"מ ח"ב א"ח סי' ק"ה, שו"ת חלקי הי"א סי' נ"ט, שו"ת) despite the circumstances. This is not just for "machmirim" [who don't drink sherry cask whisky...]; it is for any meticulous, G-d-fearing person.

Baal Korei from a Walled ["Ben Krach"] or Unwalled ["Ben Ir"] City

20. On a Purim Meshulash, everyone reads the Megilla on the 14th of Adar, but it could be that there are two separate chiyuvim, the ramifications being who can be motzi whom.
21. **Ben ir being motzi ben krach.** A ben ir [for whom Purim is on the 14th] can be motzi a ben krach in the Megilla reading. For example, someone from Bnei Brak who is in Yerushalayim on Erev Shabbos can serve as a baal korei to be motzi residents of Yerushalayim in the Megilla reading. Since a ben ir's chiyuv comes from divrei kabbala and he has his usual, standard chiyuv, he can be motzi anyone.
22. **Ben krach being motzi ben ir.** The poskim discuss whether a ben krach, whose Purim is really on the 15th but in practice reads the Megilla on the 14th, can be motzi a ben ir in the Megilla reading, given that their chiyuvim might be different.
23. Some say that since some poskim hold the nature of a ben ir's Megilla reading on the 14th is a decree of later chachamim and derabanan (ב"ר הנ"ל), a ben krach cannot be motzi a ben ir, whose chiyuv is from divrei kabbala (ה"ג סי' נ"ו) (ישועת משה ח"ג סי' נ"ו) (מקראי קודש סי' נ"א, ישועת משה ח"ג סי' נ"ו).
24. However, others hold that the chiyuv of a ben krach is primarily also from divrei kabbala and in keeping with the original decree of the Anshei Knesses Hagedola, who intended that the Megilla reading can be moved to the 14th. Accordingly, a ben krach can in fact be motzi the chiyuv of a ben ir (הגר"י א"ח סי' נ"ח, חשק שלמה דף ה., הגר"י א"ח).

Matanos La'evyonim

On the Day of the Megilla Reading

25. The time for the mitzva of matanos la'evyonim is on the day the Megilla is read because poor people look forward to the Megilla reading (גמ' מגילה דף ד' ע"ב). Thus, the mitzva of matanos la'evyonim is done on Friday (שו"ע סי' תרפ"ח סי"ו).
26. **"כל הפושט יד."** The concept of "Whoever extends his hand, we give to him" applies on Erev Shabbos as it stems from the main chiyuv of matanos la'evyonim (הגר"י זוננפעלד).
27. **Ben krach, ben ir.** A ben krach can give matanos la'evyonim to a poor person of his choosing, either another ben krach or a ben ir. Since he is giving on the day designated by Chazal, he is yetzei his chiyuv; the poor recipient can use the money for his Purim seuda whenever his personal chiyuv takes effect (הגר"י קנייבסקי).

Did Not Give Matanos La'evyonim on Erev Shabbos

28. **Realized on Shabbos.** If a person realized on Shabbos that he did not yet give matanos la'evyonim, he should summon a poor person on Shabbos and give him a substantial food, a cooked dish, or the like (הגר"ש"א הובא במועדים וזמנים ח"ב סי' קפ"ט).
29. **Realized on Sunday.** If he realized on Sunday that he did not yet give matanos la'evyonim, he should give on Sunday (הגר"י זוננפעלד).

Purim Seuda

When to Fulfill the Chiyuv

30. The poskim argue when the chiyuv of the Purim seuda [and ad d'lo yada...] takes effect.

31. **Sunday.** It is clear from the Yerushalmi that the Purim seuda is made on Sunday, Adar 16, not Shabbos. The reason is so that the Purim joy is distinctly recognizable and not combined with the Shabbos seuda (ריטב"א מגילה ה. ד"ה באלו); also, we do not mix one source of joy with another ["אין מערבין שמחה בשמחה" (פ"ר"ה סי' תרפ"ח סי"ו)]. This ruling is adopted in halacha (הר"ף והרא"ש) and treated as the main opinion (שו"ע תרפ"ח סי"ו). The minhag of Yerushalayim follows this Yerushalmi.
32. **Shabbos.** It is clear from the Bavli that the mitzva of rejoicing only applies at its usual time (מגילה ה.). Accordingly, several Rishonim write that the primary chiyuv of the Purim seuda is on Shabbos itself (הרא"ה) (הובא ברין, הריטב"א, והמאירי). In view of this, some are machmir to satisfy the Bavli too by adding somewhat to the Shabbos seuda with extra foods for the sake of the Purim seuda (הגר"י זוננפעלד).
33. **Motzei Shabbos.** Some explain that the above Yerushalmi which says the Purim seuda is pushed off means that the main time for the Purim seuda is on Motzei Shabbos. This does not violate "ולא יעבור" since for the nations of the world, the night comes after the day (משך חכמה על מגילת אסתר).
34. **Erev Shabbos.** Some say that the Purim seuda is on Erev Shabbos, the day the Megilla is read (י"מ הובא בברכי יוסף שם וברע"ב). Nevertheless, only select, meticulous individuals in Yerushalayim do this, but it is not the mainstream minhag of Yerushalayim (הגר"י זוננפעלד). If a person eats a seuda then, he must make sure to have it before chatzos since it is not the primary chiyuv.
35. **Ad d'lo yada.** The chiyuv to drink on Purim "ad d'lo yada" is connected to the day of the seuda. Hence, the main chiyuv is on Sunday. Still, someone who wants to do things in the best possible way will drink a bit of wine on Shabbos or Erev Shabbos and go to sleep – but there is no merit in getting drunk for three days straight...

Mishloach Manos

When to Fulfill the Chiyuv

36. **Day of the seuda.** Some say that the proper time to fulfill the chiyuv of mishloach manos depends on the time of the seuda since the reason for the chiyuv is to ensure that everyone has what they need to make a proper seuda (לבוש סי' ק"א, לבוש סי' תרצ"ה סי"ד). Since most poskim hold that the seuda is held on Sunday (above, 31), mishloach manos is also sent on Sunday (שו"ת רדב"ז ח"א סי' תק"ח). A person who also fulfills the mitzva of the seuda on Shabbos (מהר"ב"ה) or Erev Shabbos (מאירי) should also give mishloach manos then to do the mitzva in the best possible way.
37. On Shabbos, one can "swap his seuda" with another person, i.e., take his portion at the seuda and give it to someone present at his seuda.
38. **Day of matanos la'evyonim.** Others say that the chiyuv of mishloach manos is in force at the time of the chiyuv of matanos la'evyonim, i.e., on Erev Shabbos. They hold that the mitzva of mishloach manos cannot be fulfilled on Sunday since that is already after Purim (כנה"ג) (א"ח קנה סק"א); this is the opinion of the Chazon Ish (הג' הטור סי' תרצ"ה).

Al Hanisim

39. Al Hanisim is said on Shabbos, Adar 15, in Shmoneh Esrei and Birkas Hamazon (רדב"ז ח"א סי' תק"ח, שו"ע תרפ"ח סי"ו) so that it will be clear to everyone, including women and children, that it is Purim (שם).

Said It on Friday or Sunday

40. **Friday.** If one said Al Hanisim on Friday, he does not go back (ברכי) (מ"ב תרצ"ג סק"ו) since it has some relevance to both days (יוסף, מ"ב סק"ז).
41. **Sunday.** Al Hanisim is not said at the end of the Purim seuda on Sunday. If one says it, we do not object (הגר"י זוננפעלד), but he should say it in a Harachaman, not within Birkas Hamazon, out of concern that it is an interruption (כ"ה החיים סקמ"ח).

Intercity Travel

42. We wrote at length about intercity travel on Purim in a regular year (see Issue 81). We will now write some halachos on the topic that apply this year.
43. **Ben krach to another city.** Someone from Yerushalayim who travels to another city on Friday morning and stays there until after Shabbos is obligated in all the mitzvos of Yerushalayim Purim since he had the status of a ben krach on Friday morning. Thus, on Shabbos he should say Al Hanisim, and on Sunday he should eat his Purim seuda and give mishloach manos, even if he is in the other city. Some say he should also make a seuda and give mashloach manos on Friday in that city (פורים המשולש).
44. **Ben ir to Yerushalayim.** A ben ir who travels on Friday to Yerushalayim for Shabbos does not have the status of a ben krach whatsoever. He should do all the mitzvos of the day on Erev Shabbos and has no chiyuvim on Shabbos or Sunday (מקראי קודש סי' י"ט).